

IMPLEMENTATION OF INSIDE OUTSIDE CIRCLE METHOD TO DEVELOP STUDENTS' CRITICAL THINKING SKILLS AT SMA MUHAMMADIYAH 10 SURABAYA

Abdul Hafidz¹, Shokhibul Arifin², Moch Charis Hidayat³

^{1, 2, 3} Universitas Muhammadiyah Surabaya

¹ ahafidz2001@gmail.com, ² shokhibularifin@um-surabaya.ac.id,

³ m.charishidayat@fai.um-surabaya.ac.id

Abstract

Education plays an important role in the progress of a country because the improvement of human resources depends on education. Communication in science is very important because others will not know what to do or plan without it. The Inside Outside Circle (IOC) model enters the learning process and helps students become more active in class. The role of teachers is very important in achieving learning objectives. The Inside Outside Circle type of cooperative learning that uses small and large circle patterns emphasizes cooperation, discipline, independence, and critical thinking of students. This is one strategy that can be used to achieve these goals. and encourage them to actively participate in the learning process. This study is about the application of the inside outside circle learning model to improve students' critical thinking behavior in Islamic Religious Education subjects, and the subjects of this study are Islamic Religious Education teachers and all students at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya. This study uses a qualitative method with an Ethnographic approach. This is a classroom action research with three cycles of two meetings each. And for the data collection technique I use observation, interviews, and documentation. Observation is done by observing the learning that takes place. Compared to previous studies, this study measures students' critical thinking skills and their learning outcomes by using the Inside Outside Circle learning model in Islamic religious education lessons at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya. The Inside Outside Circle model is a learning model that utilizes real problems as a basis for students to learn and allows them to improve their ability to construct their own knowledge.

Keywords: Inside Outside Circle Method, Learning, Critical Thinking Skills

Abstract

Pendidikan memainkan peran penting dalam kemajuan sebuah negara karena peningkatan sumber daya manusia bergantung pada pendidikan. Komunikasi dalam ilmu pengetahuan sangat penting karena orang lain tidak akan tahu apa yang harus dilakukan atau direncanakan tanpanya. Model Inside Outside Circle (IOC) masuk ke dalam proses pembelajaran dan membantu siswa menjadi lebih aktif dalam kelas. Peran guru sangat penting dalam mencapai tujuan pembelajaran. Pembelajaran kooperatif tipe Inside Outside Circle yang menggunakan pola lingkaran kecil dan besar menekankan kerjasama, disiplin, kemandirian, dan pemikiran kritis siswa. Ini adalah salah satu strategi yang dapat digunakan untuk mencapai tujuan tersebut. dan mendorong mereka untuk berpartisipasi aktif dalam proses pembelajaran. Penelitian ini bertentang penerapan model pembelajarn inside outside circle untuk meningkatkan perilaku berpikir kritis siswa dalam mata pelajaran PAI, dan subjek penelitian ini yaitu guru PAI dan seluruh siswa di SMA Muhammdiyah 10 Surabaya. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode kualitatif dengan pendekatan Etnografi. Ini adalah penelitian tindakan kelas dengan tiga siklus tiap dua pertemuan. Dan untuk Teknik pengumpulan data saya menggunakan observasi, wawancara, dan dokumentasi. Observasi dilakukan dengan mengamati pembelajaran yang berlangsung. Dibandingkan dengan penelitian sebelumnya, penelitian ini mengukur kemampuan berpikir kritis siswa dan hasil belajar mereka dengan menggunakan model pembelajaran Inside Outside Circle dalam pelajaran pendidikan agama islam di SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya. Model Inside Outside Circle adalah model pembelajaran yang memanfaatkan masalah nyata sebagai dasar bagi siswa untuk belajar dan memungkinkan mereka untuk meningkatkan kemampuan mereka untuk menyusun pengetahuan mereka sendiri.

Kata kunci: Metode Inside Outside Circle, Pembelajaran, Kemampuan Berfikir Kritis



© Author(s) 2025

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

INTRODUCTION

Education plays an important role in the progress of a country, because the improvement of human resources depends on education. The growth and development of human resources depend on a person's ability to understand and apply perspectives based on their own experiences. Education, according to Article 1 of the 2003 National Education System Law, is a conscious and planned effort to create an atmosphere and learning process in which students actively develop their potential to have spiritual and religious strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble character, and skills needed by themselves, society, and the country.¹ Effective learning requires the use of appropriate strategies, supporting facilities, and other supporting elements. In addition, the teaching and learning process must also be changed. Various efforts must be made to make learning active, creative, and enjoyable. This will help improve the learning outcomes of students who have not achieved the minimum completeness criteria (KKM). The main components of the learning model form an active, creative, and enjoyable learning environment. An innovative and enjoyable learning model has the ability to increase students' interest in the subject, which in turn results in increased student learning outcomes.²

In Karismanto's book, Mulyasa said that learning strategies are strategies used in learning, such as discussions, observations, questions and answers, and other activities that encourage increased student competence. Conditioning the environment to encourage changes in student behavior is the most important responsibility of teachers in the learning process. In addition, learning strategies can be defined as a series of activity plans that include the use of methods and the utilization of various resources or strengths to achieve learning goals.³

In learning, communication is very important for students. This is because there is communication between students and other students, which results in an effective classroom atmosphere and students become active in communicating with other students. In the field of science, communication is very important because without it others will not know what to do or plan. The Inside Outside Circle (IOC) model is a learning model that enters the learning process and helps

¹ Rahmi, 'Chapter I Introduction', Galang Tanjung, 2504, 2021, 1–9.

² Dedi Wahyudi and Lilis Marwiyanti, 'Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Inside Outside Circle Dalam Mata Pelajaran Akidah Akhlak', *Jurnal MUDARRISUNA: Media Kajian Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 7.2 (2017), 267 <<https://doi.org/10.22373/jm.v7i2.2369>>.

³ Azizah Husnul Chotimah, 'Implementasi Strategi Pembelajaran Inside Outside Circle Dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Komunikasi Argumentatif', *Science Signaling*, 11.551 (2014), 746–59 <[http://webs.ucm.es/info/biomol2/Tema 01.pdf%0Ahttp://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.addr.2009.04.004](http://webs.ucm.es/info/biomol2/Tema%01.pdf%0Ahttp://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.addr.2009.04.004)>.

students become more active in learning. The Inside-Outside Circle learning technique allows students to share information simultaneously. The Inside Outside Circle collaborative learning model consists of two groups of students who pair up in a circle. Each circle consists of two parts: an outer circle and an inner circle. Two students in the outer circle and the inner circle share information with each other simultaneously. After that, the students outside the circle are silent, while the students in the inner circle move one or two steps clockwise.⁴

In SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya, just like in other schools, there is a big problem in fostering students' critical thinking behavior in Islamic Religious Education subjects. Therefore, there is an urgent need to conduct research and adopt effective learning models to support and facilitate learning that aims to foster students' critical thinking behavior. The inside-outside-circle learning model is a promising alternative. This inside-outside-circle learning approach encourages active student involvement, develops communication skills, exploration, and problem solving. In addition, this model provides students with the opportunity to improve their critical thinking skills through the problem-solving process, which requires deep thinking, situation analysis, and decision making based on what they know.

Therefore, this study is very important and significant because there has been no previous research that specifically studies the application of the inside outside circle learning model in the context of learning Islamic Religious Education (PAI) subjects at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya. This study will also fill this knowledge gap and evaluate the potential for implementing the inside outside circle learning model in the PAI curriculum.

As mentioned above, it can be concluded that the learning process should not be monotonous and tiring for students. In theory, this research should contribute to the scientific treasure (scientific wealth), the application of the model used to improve students' critical thinking and make them actively participate in the learning process. Because of the above problems, I want to conduct a research on the application of the inside outside circle learning model to improve students' critical thinking behavior in Islamic Religious Education subjects (research at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya).

In the learning process of this method, skills such as interacting with others, caring about the environment, thinking critically and creatively, solving problems, being independent, working in groups, and communicating are very important.⁵ Skills such as critical and creative thinking, problem solving, independence, working in groups, communicating, and interacting with others are very

⁴ Suarti Djafar and others, 'Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Inside-Outside-Circle (IOC) Terhadap Kemampuan Pemecahan Masalah Matematika Siswa SMAN 2 Enrekang', *Journal on Education*, 6.1 (2023), 2129–38 <<https://doi.org/10.31004/joe.v6i1.3209>>.

⁵ Ahmad Suriansyah, Akhmad Riandy Agusta, and Ananda Setiawan, 'Model Blended Learning ANTASARI Untuk Mengembangkan Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Dan Memecahkan Masalah', *Journal of Economics Education and Entrepreneurship*, 2.2 (2021), 90 <<https://doi.org/10.20527/jee.v2i2.4102>>.

important in today's learning process. Islamic Religious Education (PAI) is one of the subjects that has great potential to improve students' critical thinking behavior. PAI not only provides an understanding of Islamic teachings but also functions as a vehicle for building Islamic morals and ethics in everyday life. However, the challenges in developing students' critical thinking behavior in PAI learning are often a major concern. PAI teaching based on conventional models, which tend to emphasize memorization and conceptual knowledge, often does not allow students to think critically about complex religious and everyday life issues.⁶

THEORITICAL REVIEW

The Inside Outside Circle Cooperative Learning Model is present in the world of education, especially in classroom learning, providing a new atmosphere in the learning process. The Inside Outside Circle Cooperative Model is a learning model developed by Spencer Kagan to provide opportunities for students to share information at the same time.⁷

Learning models are often a reference for teachers to make changes in their classrooms. The student-centered learning approach creates an active learning atmosphere for students, allowing teachers to act as facilitators in the learning process. Using the Inside Outside Circle learning model is the best way to enliven the classroom atmosphere and make students more active. By using the Inside Outside Circle learning model, students gain extensive knowledge and make less active students more active. Thus, cognitive learning activities and changes in student behavior can provide better learning outcomes for students. If the classroom atmosphere is active and liked by students, then student achievement will increase.⁸

Because in the development of the very modern world of education today, the use of the Inside Outside Circle learning model is considered to be able to help in learning activities because educators must be able to arouse students' enthusiasm for learning, thinking skills, and a sense of spontaneity among students and always innovate in every learning activity.

The advantages of the IOC learning model are that it has a clear structure and allows students to share information with clear and different partners. In addition, it allows students to learn to communicate well. Inside-Outside Circle is a different cooperative learning model. It requires two students to talk about the problem in the assignment, share the results of their discussion with their

⁶ Liwaul Liwaul and others, 'Model Pengelolaan Berpikir Kritis Siswa Dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam: Melibatkan Metode Cooperative Learning', *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Al-Thariqah*, 7.2 (2022), 265–77 <[https://doi.org/10.25299/al-thariqah.2022.vol7\(2\).10579](https://doi.org/10.25299/al-thariqah.2022.vol7(2).10579)>.

⁷ Ivan Veriansyah, Adhitya Prihadi, and Rosanti Rosanti, 'Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Inside Circle Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa Oleh Guru Geografi Sma Negeri 6 Pontianak Timur', *Jurnal PIPSI (Jurnal Pendidikan IPS Indonesia)*, 5.1 (2020), 14 <<https://doi.org/10.26737/jpipsi.v5i1.1545>>.

⁸ Imam Mashuri and others, 'Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Inside Outside Circle Pada Mata Pelajaran Pai Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas X Semester Genap Sma Negeri 1 Genteng', *International Journal of Educational Resources*, 03.03 (2022).

new partner, and listen to the results of other students' discussions. It also allows students to exchange information with each other. This is a component that helps students understand the material. One of the advantages expected from using this learning model is that it can produce effective learning, which can directly improve overall student learning outcomes.⁹

The inside outside circle method not only improves communication or student interest in the lesson, but also gives them the opportunity to think critically, this is due to the fact that giving freedom to learn to educators and students indirectly opens their horizons. In the midst of today's high competitive and competitive demands, critical thinking skills are very important. Critical thinking is the ability to think systematically and rationally with the aim of understanding the relationship between ideas and or facts. One definition of critical thinking is the ability to think complexly by using the process of analysis and evaluation of the information received and in solving problems.

Critical thinking is a type of thinking where people ask, analyze, interpret, evaluate, and judge what is read, heard, and written. Because critical thinking is not an attitude that just arises, it requires continuous development. Therefore, it is a "dialectical" process, which means we can put our knowledge relationship because as long as we think, our mind is in a state of question and answer. To think, we need reason. Language is a tool for producing thoughts.¹⁰ To think critically, one must always think calmly about all possible outcomes; always think with a cool head without emotion; prioritize logic over emotion; understand the problem, analyze and evaluate the results, and then make a decision on action.¹¹

Students also demonstrate the ability to solve problems quickly and accurately, which is a characteristic of critical thinking. Students have the ability to think quickly to find the basis of the problem from the concepts and ideas discussed in the material. Students then find problems that have the same type and function. After the main problem is found correctly, the next step is to create a solution to the problem. Students must then evaluate the arguments for the answers given. They do this by giving the instructor or other students the opportunity to respond to the arguments or answers. Arguments will be stronger to solve the problem if there is input or additions. Students who provide criticism or suggestions can also be used as behavior to find and correct common mistakes in giving reasons. Judging from how students think critically, it can be seen that critical thinking is a systematic, logical, and in-depth way of thinking. Students are expected to be able to think critically radically,

⁹ Muhamad Khoirur Roziqin and Siti Aminatur Robiah, 'Pengembangan Rencana Pelaksanaan Pembelajaran (RPP) Berbasis Model Inside Outside (IOC) Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa', *EDUSCOPE: Jurnal Pendidikan, Pembelajaran, Dan Teknologi*, 8.1 (2022), 75–86 <<https://doi.org/10.32764/eduscope.v8i1.3004>>.

¹⁰ Wicaksono, 'Efektifitas Metode Pembelajaran', 01.02 (2011), 10.

¹¹ Nadhiroh S and Anshori I, 'Implementasi Kurikulum Merdeka Belajar Dalam Pengembangan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Pada Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam', *Fitrah: Journal of Islamic Education*, 4.1 (2023), 56–68 <<http://jurnal.staisumatera-medan.ac.id/fitrah>>.

freely, and loudly, and carry out deep and in-depth critical thinking activities about problems related to their subjects by conceptualizing, analyzing, and evaluating.

RESEARCH METHODS

The method used in this study is a qualitative method with an Ethnographic approach (understanding the culture and behavior of a particular group through direct observation and interaction), and this study was designed as a classroom action research, with three cycles of two meetings each. Observation of critical thinking indicators is used to improve critical thinking skills. Evaluations conducted at the end of each cycle include problem identification, investigation, preparation of general designs, implementation of actions, supervision, investigation, and revision of general concepts. So from the results of this evaluation, learning outcomes are obtained.¹²

This study aims to obtain information and analyze it more deeply to understand the application of the inside outside circle method in developing students' critical thinking in Islamic Religious Education learning. The subjects of the study were Islamic Religious Education teachers and 30 grade 12 students.

The type of data collected is qualitative related to the application of the inside outside circle method in developing critical thinking skills in Islamic religious education learning, the contribution of the inside outside circle method in developing critical thinking skills in Islamic education learning, and ways to improve critical thinking skills in Islamic religious education learning.¹³

And for the data collection technique I use observation, interviews, and documentation. Observation is done by observing the learning that is taking place, in addition to observing the learning strategies used by teachers in improving critical thinking skills. Interviews are conducted to obtain an explanation of the implementation or application, and obstacles faced by teachers in implementing the inside outside circle method.

This study emphasizes reflective and collaborative research based on field reality (natural setting). Therefore, this study uses action research. This model of research not only tries to solve learning problems in the classroom but also tries to improve the ability and professionalism of teachers through reflective and collaborative activities. This is in line with Arikunto's opinion about the purpose of this study, namely to improve the quality of learning in the classroom.¹⁴

To achieve the objectives of this study, the initial work steps of this study began by conducting observations of the research subjects, namely the situation of the student learning process

¹² Puji Rahayu Ningsih, Arif Hidayat, and Sentot Kusairi, 'Penerapan Problem Based Learning Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Dan Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas III', *Jurnal Pendidikan: Teori, Penelitian Dan Pengembangan*, 3.12 (2018), 1587–93 <<http://journal.um.ac.id/index.php/jptpp/>>.

¹³ Nadhiroh S dan Anshori I.

¹⁴ Wicaksono.

at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya in the subject of Islamic Religious Education. From the results of this observation, an analysis was carried out to determine the next research steps.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The inside outside circle method has been applied in Islamic religious education learning at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya. And there are obstacles faced so that it has not been able to fully show proud results for the development of students' critical thinking skills. As explained in the title section, this study will discuss the application of the inside outside circle method, in relation to improving critical thinking skills. The research is explained below.

Implementation of the inside outside circle learning method

According to Anita Lie, Spencer Kagan created the IOC teaching method to allow students to share information simultaneously. Several fields, such as social sciences, religion, mathematics, and language, can use this method. Subject matter that requires discussion and information between students is the most suitable for use with this IOC technique. Students can share with different partners briefly and regularly, which is an advantage of the IOC teaching approach. Students also have many opportunities to improve their communication skills and process data while working together with fellow students in a collaborative atmosphere. This IOC technique can be applied to all age levels of students.¹⁵

The Inside-Outside Circle method is a great learning method because it allows participants to talk to each other and work together. To implement this technique, follow these steps:

Critical Thinking Learning Outcomes

As a result of the research conducted at the reflection stage of cycle I, it was found that some students were in a very low category in critical thinking skills. Therefore, improvements and re-planning were needed for the second cycle, which began with the aim of improving students' critical thinking skills. The results of data analysis from the reflection stage of cycle II showed that students' critical thinking skills increased from cycle I to cycle II.

The students' classical critical thinking ability in cycle I was in the medium category (67.37%) but increased to the high category (79.07%) in cycle II because students conducted direct observations to collect data to determine the impact of the problem and the solution to the problem. The results of the classical test in cycle I showed that students' critical thinking ability was in the medium category, with a percentage of 71.12%. A total of 11 students (28.20%) were included in the very high category, 13 students (33.33%) were included in the high category, 7 students (17.94%) were included in the

¹⁵ In Herlina, Agus Suryana, and Muhamad Azhar Alwahid, 'Tarbiatuna : Journal of Islamic Education Studies Tarbiatuna : Journal of Islamic Education Studies', 2 (2022), 168–94.

medium category, 8 students (20.51%) were included in the low category, and there were no students in the very low category. The number of students included in the very high critical thinking ability category increased to 15 students (38.07%), the high category increased to 21 students (53.84%), and the medium category decreased to 3 students (7.69%). There were no students included in the very low or low critical thinking ability category.

Results Student learning outcomes in the pre-cycle, cycle I, and cycle II all increased. Student learning outcomes in the pre-cycle were sufficient with an average of 61.89, while student learning outcomes in cycle I increased to 76.33, which placed it in the good category. A total of 5 students (12.5%) were in the very good category, 12 students (30%) were in the good category, 19 students (47.5%) were in the sufficient category, 3 students (7.5%) were in the less category, and 1 student (2.5%) was in the very less category. In the second cycle, the average learning outcomes of students increased to 85.25 and were included in the very good category; a total of 11 students (27.5%) were included in the very good category, 20 students (50%) were included in the good category, 8 students (20%) were included in the sufficient category, and only 1 student (2.5%) was included in the less learning outcome category.

And I conclude that the application of the Inside Outside Circle (IOC) learning model in Islamic Religious Education learning at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya can improve students' ability to solve problems, draw conclusions, and analyze arguments. This is in accordance with the critical thinking criteria set by Johnson (2007): analyzing arguments, the ability to ask questions, the ability to answer questions, the ability to solve problems, the ability to draw conclusions, and the ability to evaluate and assess observation results.¹⁶

This study shows that using the Inside Outside Circle model can improve critical thinking skills, which include formulating problems, analyzing, deducting, inducing, evaluating, and making decisions. Until the final cycle, it is expected that 80% of learning outcomes will reach the KKM that has been set. The Circle Inside Out model is a learning model that utilizes real problems as a basis for students to learn. This allows students to improve their critical thinking skills and construct their own knowledge.

Compared to previous studies, this study measures students' critical thinking skills and their learning outcomes using the IOC learning model in Islamic religious education lessons at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya. The researcher then used story problems reinforced by observations through teacher observation sheets to measure students' critical thinking skills. In order for the results to be more accurate, the researcher also used descriptive test questions to measure students' learning outcomes. The researcher also conducted interviews with class teachers to support the results obtained

¹⁶ Ningsih, Hidayat, and Kusairi.

from improving students' critical thinking skills and their learning outcomes from the Inside Outside Circle learning model.

This is in accordance with the critical thinking criteria set by Johnson (2007): analyzing arguments, the ability to ask questions, the ability to answer questions, the ability to solve problems, the ability to draw conclusions, and the ability to evaluate, the ability to discuss and assess the results of observations.¹⁷

In addition, the results of this study were previously supported by previous research conducted by Shinta Oktrifani entitled THE EFFECT OF THE INSIDE OUTSIDE CIRCLE (IOC) LEARNING MODEL ON MATHEMATICAL CRITICAL THINKING ABILITIES AS SEEN IN THE FROM STUDENTS' ACHIEVEMENT MOTIVATION, showing that the use of the inside outside circle (IOC) model can improve critical thinking skills, which include the ability to formulate problems, analyze, deduct, induce, and share information. Until the final cycle, it is expected that 80% of learning outcomes will reach the KKM that has been set.

Compared to previous studies, this study evaluates students' critical thinking skills and their learning outcomes using the inside outside circle learning model in Islamic Religious Education lessons at SMA Muhammadiyah 10 Surabaya. To measure students' critical thinking skills, researchers use story questions or viral news reinforced by observations made by teachers through observation sheets or videos. In addition, students' learning outcomes are evaluated using students' learning outcomes from the class. I conducted the study by interviewing class teachers to support the results obtained from improving students' critical thinking skills and learning outcomes through the inside outside circle learning model.

CONCLUSION

With the results of the research that I use, I conclude that in Islamic Religious Education learning, students show an increase in communication skills through the Inside Outside Circle model. The increase in each indicator shows that students are more active in learning and communicate more often with other students.

Results Student learning, especially in Islamic Religious Education subjects, can be improved by implementing the Inner and Outer Circle Learning Model (IOC). This is proven by the increase in students' critical thinking ability scores in cycle I from 67.37% to 79.7% in cycle II.

Inside outside circle method, known as the inner circle and outer circle technique, using a small circle and large circle system. In this method, students share information with different partners briefly and regularly. And for its advantages, namely Getting different information at once, making it easier to break into pairs, encouraging more ideas, and making it easier to solve problems.

¹⁷ Ningsih, Hidayat, and Kusairi.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Chotimah, Azizah Husnul, 'Implementasi Strategi Pembelajaran Inside Outside Circle Dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Komunikasi Argumentatif', *Science Signaling*, 11.551 (2014), 746–59 <<http://webs.ucm.es/info/biomol2/Tema01.pdf%0Ahttp://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.addr.2009.04.004>>
- Djafar, Suarti, Putriyani S, Hafsyah Hafsyah, Rustiani S, and Dian Firdiani, 'Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Inside-Outside-Circle (IOC) Terhadap Kemampuan Pemecahan Masalah Matematika Siswa SMAN 2 Enrekang', *Journal on Education*, 6.1 (2023), 2129–38 <<https://doi.org/10.31004/joe.v6i1.3209>>
- Herlina, In, Agus Suryana, and Muhamad Azhar Alwahid, 'Tarbiatuna : Journal of Islamic Education Studies Tarbiatuna : Journal of Islamic Education Studies', 2 (2022), 168–94
- Liwaul Liwaul, Siti Mubaroqah, Pairin Pairin, and Aris Try Andreas Putra, 'Model Pengelolaan Berpikir Kritis Siswa Dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam: Melibatkan Metode Cooperative Learning', *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Al-Thariqah*, 7.2 (2022), 265–77 <[https://doi.org/10.25299/al-thariqah.2022.vol7\(2\).10579](https://doi.org/10.25299/al-thariqah.2022.vol7(2).10579)>
- Mashuri, Imam, Anis Fauzi, Nikhla Alfiyana, and Kata Kunci, 'Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Inside Outside Circle Pada Mata Pelajaran Pai Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas X Semester Genap Sma Negeri 1 Genteng', *International Journal of Educational Resources*, 03.03 (2022)
- Nadhiroh S, and Anshori I, 'Implementasi Kurikulum Merdeka Belajar Dalam Pengembangan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Pada Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam', *Fitrah: Journal of Islamic Education*, 4.1 (2023), 56–68 <<http://jurnal.staisumatera-medan.ac.id/fitrah>>
- Ningsih, Puji Rahayu, Arif Hidayat, and Sentot Kusairi, 'Penerapan Problem Based Learning Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Dan Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas III', *Jurnal Pendidikan: Teori, Penelitian Dan Pengembangan*, 3.12 (2018), 1587–93 <<http://journal.um.ac.id/index.php/jptpp/>>
- Rahmi, 'Bab I Pendahuluan با حض خ', *Galang Tanjung*, 2504, 2021, 1–9
- Roziqin, Muhamad Khoirur, and Siti Aminatur Robiah, 'Pengembangan Rencana Pelaksanaan Pembelajaran (RPP) Berbasis Model Inside Outside (IOC) Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa', *EDUSCOPE: Jurnal Pendidikan, Pembelajaran, Dan Teknologi*, 8.1 (2022), 75–86 <<https://doi.org/10.32764/eduscope.v8i1.3004>>
- Suriansyah, Ahmad, Akhmad Riandy Agusta, and Ananda Setiawan, 'Model Blended Learning ANTASARI Untuk Mengembangkan Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Dan Memecahkan Masalah', *Journal of Economics Education and Entrepreneurship*, 2.2 (2021), 90 <<https://doi.org/10.20527/jee.v2i2.4102>>
- Veriansyah, Ivan, Adhitya Prihadi, and Rosanti Rosanti, 'Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Inside Circle Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa Oleh Guru Geografi Sma Negeri 6 Pontianak Timur', *Jurnal PIPSI (Jurnal Pendidikan IPS Indonesia)*, 5.1 (2020), 14 <<https://doi.org/10.26737/jpipsi.v5i1.1545>>
- Wahyudi, Dedi, and Lilis Marwiyanti, 'Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Inside Outside Circle Dalam Mata Pelajaran Akidah Akhlak', *Jurnal MUDARRISUNA: Media Kajian Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 7.2 (2017), 267 <<https://doi.org/10.22373/jm.v7i2.2369>>
- Wicaksono, 'Efektifitas Metode Pembelajaran', 01.02 (2011), 10