

INDEPENDENT UMRAH POLICY: BETWEEN IDEALITY AND REALITY

Ahmad Mustafa¹, Abdul Rozaq²

^{1, 2} Universitas Islam Negeri Walisongo Semarang, Indonesia

¹ 2201056084@student.walisongo.ac.id, ² abdul_rozaq@walisongo.ac.id

Abstract

This study aims to analyze the dynamics of the implementation of the Independent Umrah policy in Indonesia using the Adaptive and Networked Implementation Theory framework proposed by Hupe and Hill (2016) and the Projection Model by Jensen and Johansson (2018). The Independent Umrah policy is an integral part of the reform and digital transformation agenda of the public service sector, particularly in the management of the Umrah pilgrimage, realized through the development and utilization of the SISKOPATUH system. This system is designed to provide pilgrims with more direct and autonomous access to manage the Umrah departure process without complete dependence on conventional Umrah travel agencies. This study employed a qualitative approach, with data collection techniques consisting of in-depth interviews with independent Umrah pilgrims and analysis of related policy documents and regulations. The results indicate a significant gap between the ideals of the policy, which focuses on service efficiency, process transparency, and strengthening pilgrim independence, and the reality of implementation on the ground. Various obstacles were identified, such as low digital literacy levels among pilgrims, resistance from travel agencies who felt their role was being reduced, and limited infrastructure readiness and technical support from the government. Further analysis shows that the successful implementation of the Independent Umrah policy is greatly influenced by the effectiveness of cross-actor collaboration, the flexibility of the implementation network, and the government's adaptive capacity in responding to evolving social and institutional dynamics.

Keywords: public policy, independent Umrah, policy implementation, digital governance, SISKOPATUH

Abstrak

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis dinamika implementasi kebijakan Umrah Mandiri di Indonesia dengan menggunakan kerangka Adaptive and Networked Implementation Theory sebagaimana dikemukakan oleh Hupe dan Hill (2016) serta Projectification Model dari Jensen dan Johansson (2018). Kebijakan Umrah Mandiri merupakan bagian integral dari agenda reformasi dan transformasi digital sektor pelayanan publik, khususnya dalam penyelenggaraan ibadah umrah, yang diwujudkan melalui pengembangan dan pemanfaatan sistem SISKOPATUH. Sistem ini dirancang untuk memberikan akses yang lebih langsung dan otonom kepada jamaah dalam mengelola proses keberangkatan umrah tanpa ketergantungan penuh pada biro perjalanan umrah konvensional. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif dengan teknik pengumpulan data berupa wawancara mendalam terhadap jamaah umrah mandiri serta analisis dokumen kebijakan dan regulasi terkait. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan adanya kesenjangan yang cukup signifikan antara idealitas kebijakan yang berorientasi pada efisiensi layanan, transparansi proses, serta penguatan kemandirian jamaah dengan realitas implementasi di lapangan. Berbagai kendala ditemukan, seperti rendahnya tingkat literasi digital sebagian jamaah, resistensi dari biro perjalanan yang merasa perannya tereduksi, serta keterbatasan kesiapan infrastruktur dan dukungan teknis dari pemerintah. Analisis lebih lanjut menunjukkan bahwa keberhasilan implementasi kebijakan Umrah Mandiri sangat dipengaruhi oleh efektivitas kolaborasi lintas aktor, fleksibilitas jaringan implementasi, serta kemampuan adaptif pemerintah dalam merespons dinamika sosial dan institusional yang berkembang.

Kata kunci: kebijakan publik, umrah mandiri, implementasi kebijakan, digital governance, SISKOPATUH



© Author(s) 2026

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

INTRODUCTION

The phenomenon of independent Umrah represents a paradigm shift in the governance of religious services in Indonesia. The government, through the Ministry of Religious Affairs, is striving to adapt to developments in information technology to provide easier access for the public.¹ The background to the emergence of this policy cannot be separated from the dynamics of globalization and digitalization of public services, which demands that the bureaucracy move towards a more efficient, transparent and accountable system..²In the context of religious service reform, the Independent Umrah policy is a form of innovation that is oriented towards increasing the independence of pilgrims in organizing their travel process without having to rely entirely on travel agencies.³

Ideally, this policy is in line with the mandate of Law Number 8 of 2019 concerning the Implementation of the Hajj and Umrah Pilgrimages, which emphasizes protection, convenience, and justice for pilgrims.⁴ Through the digital system SISKOPATUH (Integrated Computerized Management System for Umrah and Special Hajj), pilgrims can access various official information on matters such as visas, transportation, accommodations, and travel costs. This policy is also intended to curb the practice of ticket scalping and fraud that previously occurred frequently due to a lack of transparency among travel agencies..⁵Thus, Umrah Mandiri is present as a form of modernization of governance which is expected to create efficient and equitable services for the community.

However, in practice, the implementation of this policy has not been optimal. Many pilgrims still have difficulty accessing digital systems due to low technological literacy, while travel agencies fear losing the economic role that has supported their businesses.⁶ This situation creates tension between the ideals of policies aimed at increasing efficiency and the reality on the ground, which still faces structural, technological, and social obstacles. This gap demonstrates that the Independent Umrah policy is not merely an administrative issue, but also involves power relations, actor adaptation, and the government's ability to manage change within a complex policy ecosystem.

¹ A. Wahid, "Digitalisasi Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Umrah Di Indonesia: Peluang Dan Tantangan," *Jurnal Kajian Keagamaan Dan Sosial* 12, no. 1 (2023): 67–80.

² Kementerian Agama RI, *Petunjuk Teknis Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Umrah Mandiri* (Direktorat Bina Umrah dan Haji Khusus, 2022).

³ Ade Eka Safitri, "Hasil Wawancara Mendalam: Motivasi Dan Pengalaman Umrah Mandiri," preprint, 2025.

⁴ Kementerian Agama RI, "Wawancara Pegawai Kanwil Kemenag Jawa Tengah Terkait UU No. 14 Tahun 2025," preprint, 2025.

⁵ Richard E. Matland, "Synthesizing the Implementation Literature: The Ambiguity-Conflict Model of Policy Implementation," *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 5, no. 2 (1995): 145–74.

⁶ Chris Ansell and Jacob Torfing, "Institutional Resistance to Innovation in the Public Sector," *Public Management Review*, 2021.

Furthermore, the successful implementation of public policy depends heavily on coordination between actors and the government's ability to respond to emerging dynamics at the implementation level. In the context of Independent Umrah, the government plays a role not only as a regulator but also as a facilitator in ensuring the inclusive operation of the digital system. The government must be able to integrate the interests of travel agencies, pilgrims, and digital service providers within a mutually supportive policy ecosystem. This is where the theory of adaptive and networked implementation becomes relevant in analyzing how interactions between actors determine policy effectiveness.⁷ In addition to these theories, the Projectification Model approach provides an important conceptual framework.⁸

The Independent Umrah Policy can be viewed as a digital government project that requires flexible management, cross-sector coordination, and ongoing evaluation. This approach recognizes the policy not as a finished product, but rather as a dynamic process that is continually refined based on feedback and conditions on the ground.⁹ This approach helps to see how the government builds a project-based implementation strategy with specific time and resource constraints.¹⁰

Based on the description above, this study aims to analyze the dynamics of the implementation of the Independent Umrah policy in Indonesia, highlighting the gap between the ideal and the reality of its implementation. The study also seeks to identify inhibiting factors and adaptive strategies implemented by the government to strengthen the effectiveness of this policy. By focusing on government policy analysis, this study is expected to contribute to the development of public policy implementation theory in the digital era and provide recommendations for improving transparent and participatory governance of the Umrah pilgrimage.¹¹

LITERATURE REVIEW

The development of public policy implementation theory has shifted from a bureaucratic paradigm to a collaborative and digital paradigm. In the previous era, public policy was understood as a linear process from formulation to implementation, with bureaucracy being the primary actor controlling policy outcomes.¹² However, the complexity of modern social problems demands a more flexible, adaptive, and participatory approach. In this context, two important theories have

⁷ R. Nugroho, *Public Policy: Teori, Manajemen, Dinamika, Analisis, Konvergensi, Dan Kimia Kebijakan*, 2017.

⁸ Christian Jensen and Staffan Johansson, "The Projectification of Public Administration," *International Journal of Public Administration* 41, no. 11 (2018): 845–55.

⁹ Kementrian Agama RI, "Wawancara Mengenai Evaluasi Pasca-Musim Haji UU No. 14 Tahun 2025," preprint, 2025.

¹⁰ Abdul Rozaq, "Wawancara: Analisis Dampak Restrukturisasi Operasional Biro Travel," preprint, 2025.

¹¹ Nugroho, *Public Policy: Teori, Manajemen, Dinamika, Analisis, Konvergensi, Dan Kimia Kebijakan*.

¹² Sugiyono, *Understanding Qualitative Research*.

emerged that provide a new framework for understanding the dynamics of policy implementation in the digital age: Collaborative Governance 2.0 and Digital Era Governance (DEG).¹³ Collaborative Governance 2.0 theory views public policy as the result of a co-creation process between the government, the public, and the private sector. No single actor is completely dominant in determining the success of implementation. This model emphasizes the importance of active participation, open dialogue, and collective learning to achieve policy objectives. Ansell and Torfing argue that collaboration must be oriented toward innovation and sustainability, not merely administrative coordination. In the context of Independent Umrah, this theory helps explain how interactions between the Ministry of Religious Affairs, travel agencies, and pilgrims form a new collaborative space in digital-based pilgrimage governance.¹⁴ Meanwhile, the Digital Era Governance (DEG) theory stems from the idea that emphasizes fundamental transformation in the way the government designs and implements public policies through digitalization.¹⁵ In this model, successful policy implementation depends heavily on the government's ability to integrate data, technology, and public services. Digital Era Governance emphasizes three key principles: cross-agency information system integration, service process automation, and data-driven transparency. These principles align with the Independent Umrah policy, which utilizes the SISKOPATUH system as an integrated digital platform for managing pilgrimages.¹⁶ These two theories converge in terms of collaborative orientation and the use of technology to strengthen public participation. In the implementation of the Independent Umrah policy, interaction between actors within the digital ecosystem is a key factor. The government acts as an enabler, providing infrastructure, while travel agencies and pilgrims become both users and partners in the policy system. This approach demands a new, more fluid, network-based form of coordination (network governance), where the flow of information and responsibility is no longer hierarchical but rather horizontally shared among policy actors.

Using a combination of Collaborative Governance 2.0 and Digital Era Governance, this study positions the Independent Umrah policy as a representation of the transformation of public policy toward collaborative digital governance. This theory allows for a comprehensive analysis of the gap between the ideals of a policy oriented toward efficiency, transparency, and pilgrim independence and the reality of implementation, which is still characterized by challenges in digital literacy, travel agency resistance, and bureaucratic adaptation.¹⁷ Therefore, these two approaches

¹³ Patrick Dunleavy and Helen Margetts, "Data Science, Artificial Intelligence and the Future of Governance," *Policy and Politics* 49, no. 1 (2021): 3–21.

¹⁴ Rozaq, "Wawancara: Analisis Dampak Restrukturisasi Operasional Biro Travel."

¹⁵ Dunleavy and Margetts, "Data Science, Artificial Intelligence and the Future of Governance."

¹⁶ RI, *Petunjuk Teknis Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Umrah Mandiri*.

¹⁷ Ade Eka Safitri, "Wawancara: Tantangan Literasi Digital Jamaah Umrah Mandiri," preprint, 2025.

provide a strong conceptual basis for understanding the dynamics of religious policy implementation in the era of digital transformation.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research was conducted in Semarang City, one of the pilot areas for the implementation of the Independent Umrah policy and a hub for Umrah travel agencies such as MHU Walisongo Tour. This location was selected purposively due to its direct link to policy implementation and the availability of relevant informants, including government officials, travel agencies, and Umrah pilgrims. The research was conducted over three months, from February to April 2025, and included initial observation, data collection, and interview analysis.

The approach used is descriptive qualitative because it is considered the most appropriate for understanding complex public policy phenomena from the perspective of policy actors..¹⁸ This approach allows researchers to explore in depth the meanings, perceptions, and social dynamics that emerge in the implementation of the Independent Umrah policy.¹⁹ This research is based on the theories of Collaborative Governance 2.0 and Digital Era Governance, both of which emphasize the importance of cross-actor collaboration and the use of digital technology in strengthening the effectiveness of modern governance.²⁰

The research data was collected through two main techniques: in-depth interviews and document review. The research informants consisted of three main groups: officials from the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, managers of the MHU Walisongo Tour travel agency, and independent Umrah pilgrims who had used the SISKOPATUH system. The interviews were conducted in a semi-structured manner to openly explore the experiences, perceptions, and obstacles faced by the actors in the policy implementation process. Meanwhile, document review was conducted on various regulations and official reports, including Law Number 8 of 2019 concerning the Implementation of the Hajj and Umrah Pilgrimages, Law Number 14 of 2025 concerning the Implementation of Independent Umrah and the Digital Transformation of Religious Services, and the Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Independent Umrah issued by the Ministry of Religious Affairs.²¹

The collected data was analyzed using thematic analysis with the steps of data reduction, categorization, and thematic interpretation.²² The interview results and documents were grouped into several main themes: policy ideals, implementation realities, and collaborative adaptation. Data

¹⁸ Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, R&D* (Alfabeta, 2019).

¹⁹ Sugiyono, *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif* (Alfabeta, 2016).

²⁰ Ansell and Torfing, "Institutional Resistance to Innovation in the Public Sector."

²¹ RI, "Wawancara Pegawai Kanwil Kemenag Jawa Tengah Terkait UU No. 14 Tahun 2025."

²² Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, R&D*.

validity was maintained through source triangulation, comparing information from government officials, travel agencies, and pilgrims, and member checking to ensure congruence between the researcher and informants. The analysis process was iterative to identify patterns of relationships between actors and explain how the Independent Umrah policy is implemented amidst the ever-evolving dynamics of collaboration and digital transformation.²³

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Policy Ideality

The independent Umrah policy, formalized through Law Number 14 of 2025, emerged as a strategic response to global dynamics and the demands for modernization of public services in Indonesia. The primary objective of this policy is to provide legal recognition to citizens' human rights to perform their religious duties flexibly without having to rely entirely on conventional travel packages. An employee at the Central Java Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs explained that "the government legalized independent Umrah because travel is a human right, and the Saudi Arabian government has also permitted it through digital systems like Nusuk." This statement demonstrates that, ideally, this policy is based on the principles of equality and freedom of worship. The emergence of this policy is also inseparable from the trend of digitalization of public religious services triggered by Saudi Arabia's global vision, which was then adopted by the Indonesian government to reduce bureaucratic chains that have been considered rigid.²⁴ Ideally, the state seeks to position itself as a facilitator that ensures easy access to worship through regulations that are adaptive to developments in information technology.

The underlying values of this policy are firmly rooted in the principles of good governance, particularly the aspects of transparency, accountability and efficiency.²⁵ From an idealistic perspective, the government aims to create an Umrah ecosystem where every process, from registration to departure, can be openly monitored by the public. Efficiency is the key word, where pilgrims are expected to reduce unnecessary additional costs through partial service options. The value of accountability is realized through the standardization of digital services, so that the state maintains a moral and legal responsibility to ensure that every citizen performing the pilgrimage abroad receives their basic rights are fulfilled and protected. This was reaffirmed by the same source from the Ministry of Religious Affairs that "the government only provides regulations and guarantees, while reports and data remain integrated through the SISKOPATUH system." Thus, the

²³ Sugiyono, *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*.

²⁴ R. Hidayat, "Implementasi Kebijakan Umrah Mandiri Dalam Perspektif Perlindungan Jamaah," *Jurnal Ilmu Kebijakan Publik Dan Sosial* 5, no. 2 (2023): 115–28.

²⁵ Wahid, "Digitalisasi Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Umrah Di Indonesia: Peluang Dan Tantangan."

state is no longer the sole service provider, but rather a facilitator that opens up space for public participation in line with the Digital Era Governance paradigm.²⁶

The system design that supports this ideal is data integration through the SISKOPATUH (Integrated Umrah and Special Hajj Management Information System) application. This system is designed as a single platform that functions to automatically verify pilgrim data, from passport validation, visas, to proof of health insurance. SISKOPATUH prioritizes user-centric services that allow independent pilgrims to remain registered in the state monitoring system even though they arrange their accommodation independently. By synchronizing data between the Ministry of Religious Affairs, PPIU (as validator), and authorities in Saudi Arabia, this system is expected to become a quality control instrument that ensures the safety of pilgrims remains within the protection radar of the central government and the Indonesian Consulate General.

A pilgrim named Ade Eka Safitri described her experience that "she looked for all the preparations herself, from tickets to hotels, and it turned out that everything was easy in Saudi Arabia because the system was clear."²⁷ These findings demonstrate that digitalization policies provide actual space for pilgrims to organize their own travel with minimal guidance from travel agencies. In this context, the policy's ideality is reflected in the ease of access, flexibility of worship, and cost efficiency directly experienced by pilgrims.²⁸

Theoretically, the ideal design of this independent Umrah policy is very much in line with the concept of Digital Era Governance (DEG).²⁹ This theory emphasizes the reintegration of public services and comprehensive digitalization as a means to increase public utility. Referring to supporting data in Law No. 14 of 2025, this system integration reflects what Patrick Dunleavy calls a "holistic shift" in bureaucracy, where technology is not merely a tool but the heart of policy operations.³⁰ In an ideal situation with low ambiguity as in Richard Matland's model, this design should be able to create procedural clarity that makes the congregation feel digitally empowered without losing mandatory legal protections.³¹

However, the travel agency MHU Walisongo Tour, through a statement from Abdul Rozaq, strongly rejected the idea: "Stop independent Umrah! Because the government's job is to guarantee service and security for pilgrims. If it's independent, who will be responsible?" This quote demonstrates a conceptual tension between the ideal of government participation and industry

²⁶ Dunleavy and Margetts, "Data Science, Artificial Intelligence and the Future of Governance."

²⁷ Ade Eka Safitri, "Wawancara Mendalam: Pengalaman Dan Kemudahan Teknis Umrah Mandiri," preprint, 2025.

²⁸ Hidayat, "Implementasi Kebijakan Umrah Mandiri Dalam Perspektif Perlindungan Jamaah."

²⁹ Dunleavy and Margetts, "Data Science, Artificial Intelligence and the Future of Governance."

³⁰ Amanda Clarke, "Digital Government Units: What Are They, and Why Do They Matter?," *Public Management Review* 22, no. 3 (2020): 354–73.

³¹ Helga Pölzl and Oliver Treib, *Implementing Public Policy BT - Handbook of Public Policy Analysis* (Routledge, 2021).

players' concerns about the loss of oversight and protection of pilgrims. This tension is important to understand as part of the transition to collaborative governance.³²

Thus, conceptually the policy *Independent Umrah* can be viewed as an innovation in worship governance that combines religious values, human rights, and digital modernization. The idealism of this policy demonstrates the government's commitment to providing equitable, technology-based public services without diminishing the spiritual dimension of the community. However, the interview findings above also remind us that this ideal can only be achieved if the government balances digital transformation with guarantees of congregational protection.³³ The success of this policy depends heavily on the government's ability to maintain collaboration between bureaus, congregations, and digital monitoring systems to prevent inequalities in practice.³⁴

Implementation Reality

The implementation of the Independent Umrah policy in the field shows significant variation in results across regions. An interview with the Central Java Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs stated that "the government has prepared a digital system and guidelines, but public readiness is indeed uneven. Large cities have adapted more quickly, but in the regions, many still don't understand how to access SISKOPATUH." This illustrates that regional readiness is a key factor influencing implementation effectiveness. Meanwhile, on the pilgrim side, Ade Eka Safitri's experience shows positive results: "I can manage it myself without any hassle, as long as I know the procedures and have internet access."³⁵ A comparison of these two perspectives shows that the success of the Independent Umrah policy is highly dependent on digital literacy and local infrastructure support.³⁶

Technical and social constraints also posed significant challenges in the initial implementation phase. Although the SISKOPATUH system is already operational nationwide, implementation at the user level is often hampered by a lack of support and outreach. Congregants unfamiliar with digital technology experience difficulties with self-registration or understanding administrative verification. A Ministry of Religious Affairs official acknowledged that "many elderly congregants are unable to operate the application, so they continue to seek assistance from

³² Harbani Pasolong, *Teori Administrasi Publik* (Alfabeta, 2020).

³³ Abdul Rozaq, "Hasil Wawancara Mendalam: Resistensi Dan Dampak Ekonomi Umrah Mandiri," preprint, 2025.

³⁴ Teguh Kurniawan, "Collaborative Governance Dalam Pelayanan Publik Di Era Disrupsi," *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara* 18, no. 1 (2022).

³⁵ Ade Eka Safitri, "Wawancara: Keberhasilan Adaptasi Teknologi Bagi Jamaah Mandiri," preprint, 2025.

³⁶ Richardus Eko Indrajit, *E-Government: Strategi Pembangunan Dan Pengembangan Sistem Pelayanan Publik Berbasis Teknologi Digital* (Pre-Press, 2020).

the bureau even though the independent system is in place." This situation underscores that digital policy is not only about technological readiness, but also social readiness.³⁷ In the context of digital governance, this indicates the existence of a digital divide which remains a major obstacle to policy effectiveness.³⁸

Conflicts between policy actors also emerged as a consequence of changes in service structures. The government is pushing for digital transformation to make pilgrims more independent, while travel agencies feel marginalized. Abdul Rozaq, the manager of MHU Walisongo Tour, emphasized his objections, stating: "We feel sidelined. Yet agencies like ours have extensive experience in ensuring pilgrim safety. If everything is independent, who will be responsible when problems arise abroad?"³⁹ This view describes the existence of institutional resistance, namely the rejection by old actors of new collaborative systems that are considered to threaten their traditional roles.⁴⁰ This tension shows that the transition to digital governance has not been fully accepted by all parties involved due to clashing economic and authority interests.⁴¹

The gap between policy ideals and on-the-ground reality is increasingly apparent as the government emphasizes efficiency and transparency, but implementation remains limited by human capacity and inter-agency coordination. Ideally, a digital system should provide convenience and independence for pilgrims, but in some areas, pilgrims still have to visit travel agencies for technical assistance. As Ade Eka Safitri explained, "I still ask friends who have traveled through travel agencies, afraid of making mistakes because I'm not used to registering on my own." This situation demonstrates that policies designed to minimize dependency are actually creating a new form of dependency: the need for informal guidance.⁴² In terms of success indicators, this policy has indeed increased data transparency, but has not been able to fully increase the independence of the congregation as a whole.⁴³

A partial evaluation of these findings indicates that differences in digital capacity, economic interests, and risk perceptions between actors are the main factors contributing to the suboptimal implementation of the Independent Umrah policy. While the government strives to act as an enabler

³⁷ Agus Subianto, *Kebijakan Publik: Tinjauan Perencanaan, Implementasi Dan Evaluasi* (Brilliant, 2020).

³⁸ Zainal A. Hasibuan, "Transformasi Digital Di Indonesia: Tantangan Literasi Dan Kesiapan Infrastruktur," *Jurnal Sistem Informasi Dan Teknologi* 15, no. 3 (2021).

³⁹ Abdul Rozaq, "Wawancara: Keberatan Biro Travel Terhadap Perubahan Struktur Pelayanan Umrah," preprint, 2025.

⁴⁰ Eka S. Suaib, "Dinamika Konflik Dan Kolaborasi Dalam Implementasi Kebijakan Publik," *Jurnal Administrasi Publik Indonesia* 10, no. 1 (2021).

⁴¹ Agus Dwiyanto, *Mewujudkan Good Governance Melalui Pelayanan Publik* (Gadjah Mada University Press, 2021).

⁴² Miftah Thoha, *Manajemen Kepegawaian Sipil Di Indonesia* (Kencana, 2020).

⁴³ Teguh Kurniawan, "Tantangan Birokrasi Digital Di Negara Berkembang: Perspektif Indonesia," *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara* 18, no. 2 (2022).

by providing infrastructure and regulations, travel agencies still play a crucial role in ensuring the safety and comfort of pilgrims.⁴⁴ Conversely, those with advanced digital skills are beginning to benefit from the system's convenience, while other groups are left behind. Therefore, the effectiveness of this policy depends on the ability of all actors to adapt to the new collaborative system. As emphasized in the theory of Collaborative Governance 2.0, successful implementation is not simply the result of policy design, but rather a process of negotiation and collaborative learning between actors in addressing the changing paradigm of public service.⁴⁵

Government Adaptation

In facing the dynamics of implementation *Independent Umrah* The Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia demonstrated an adaptive response through a series of corrective measures at the central and regional levels. An official from the Central Java Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs explained that "we conducted direct outreach to the Office of Religious Affairs (KUA) and travel agencies to ensure they understood the system's functions, and trained SISKOPATUH operators in each province to assist pilgrims." This step demonstrates the government's recognition of the digital literacy gap among the public and is attempting to bridge it through training and the provision of technical assistance. In addition to training, the Ministry of Religious Affairs has also begun strengthening its digital monitoring system so that every pilgrim registration process can be tracked automatically. This effort aligns with the Digital Era Governance approach, which emphasizes the importance of continuous learning and data-based management in modern governance.⁴⁶

Cross-actor collaboration is the next important strategy. The government recognizes that the success of the policy *Independent Umrah* This cannot be achieved unilaterally, but requires synergy with travel agencies and the community. Abdul Rozaq, a resource person from MHU Walisongo Tour, explained that "recently, the Ministry of Religious Affairs has begun engaging us in dialogue again. He said travel agencies can continue to act as official partners to assist pilgrims who need guidance."⁴⁷ This statement signals a shift in the government's approach from a top-down approach to a more collaborative one. This new form of partnership allows the bureau to shift its role from sole implementer to technology facilitator and provider of additional services, such as document consultation and digital-based manasik guidance. This collaborative pattern reflects the

⁴⁴ A. I. Nasution, "Kesenjangan Digital Dan Tantangan Pelayanan Publik Di Indonesia," *Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Informatika* 14, no. 1 (2020).

⁴⁵ Dunleavy and Margetts, "Data Science, Artificial Intelligence and the Future of Governance."

⁴⁶ Eko Prasjo, "Transformasi Digital Dan Reformasi Birokrasi Di Indonesia: Peluang Dan Tantangan," *Jurnal Studi Pemerintahan* 12, no. 2 (2021).

⁴⁷ Abdul Rozaq, "Wawancara: Transformasi Peran Biro Travel Sebagai Mitra Strategis," preprint, 2025.

co-creation principle of Collaborative Governance 2.0, where various parties work together to create public value through innovation and two-way communication.⁴⁸

In addition to the social aspect, the government is also strengthening digital infrastructure to ensure efficient system integration. SISKOPATUH is now being developed to connect with the national population system (Dukcapil) to ensure the validity of pilgrim data. This step was acknowledged by a Ministry of Religious Affairs employee, who stated that "pilgrim data verification is now automatically linked to the National Identity Number (NIK) and passport, making it faster and more secure." This cross-system integration reinforces the principle of data-driven policy, where interoperability between institutions is key to the efficiency of digital bureaucracy in Indonesia.⁴⁹ With interoperability-based digitalization, the government can minimize the potential for data duplication and increase the speed of service, while strengthening public trust in electronic government systems.

Theoretically, these adaptive measures reflect the practical application of adaptive governance. Within this framework, policies are not viewed as final products, but rather as dynamic processes that are continuously refined through dialogue and public feedback. The government demonstrated its ability to learn by doing, improving systems and procedures based on field experience. Collaborations with travel agencies and pilgrims demonstrate the evolutionary nature of policy implementation—moving from resistance to synergy. In this way, the implementation process serves as a social laboratory where the government and the public learn to understand each other's roles, boundaries, and responsibilities within the context of modern public administration reform.⁵⁰

The results of this adaptive strategy demonstrate increased policy legitimacy and public trust. Pilgrims like Ade Eka Safitri expressed that they are "now more confident using this system because the data is secure and the Umrah permit is issued directly by the Ministry of Religious Affairs." This experience demonstrates that the government's adaptive measures are beginning to have a tangible impact on public trust. Constructive collaboration with travel agencies, ongoing digital literacy training, and strengthening of data infrastructure have made the Independent Umrah policy more institutionally and socially robust. Thus, the government's adaptation not only improves the technical implementation mechanisms but also strengthens the policy's moral and social legitimacy in the public eye.

⁴⁸ Teguh Kurniawan, "Collaborative Governance Dalam Pelayanan Publik Di Era Disrupsi Digital," *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara* 18, no. 1 (2022).

⁴⁹ Saniman, "Interoperabilitas Data Dalam Mewujudkan Sistem Pemerintahan Berbasis Elektronik (SPBE)," *Jurnal Teknologi Informasi Dan Komunikasi* 10, no. 2 (2021).

⁵⁰ Agus Suryono, *Teori Dan Strategi Perubahan Sosial* (Bumi Aksara, 2020).

Reflection

The main findings of this study demonstrate that the implementation of the Independent Umrah policy represents a complex transition process between the ideals of digitalizing public services and the social realities of Indonesian society. Three key findings can be concluded. First, normatively, this policy has succeeded in establishing a strong legal framework and digital system through Law No. 14 of 2025 and the integration of SISKOPATUH. Second, during the implementation phase, tensions emerged between actors triggered by differing interests and readiness to adapt. Third, the government demonstrated an adaptive response through training, outreach, and collaboration with travel agencies. As stated by a Ministry of Religious Affairs official, "we continue to improve the system so that pilgrims are assisted and travel agencies remain involved." This finding confirms that implementing public policy in the digital era requires the government's ability to continuously balance system efficiency with social dynamics in the field.⁵¹ In terms of practical benefits, the Independent Umrah policy has proven to have a positive impact on efficiency, accountability, and pilgrim protection. Pilgrims can access official information, compare prices, and verify documents online without having to rely entirely on travel agents. According to Ade Eka Safitri, "now all data can be checked directly in the system, so there's no fear of being cheated or lied to by agents." This shows that this policy has increased pilgrims' sense of security and trust in public services. Furthermore, digital-based transparency also reduces the scope for administrative manipulation, strengthens oversight, and reduces the potential for violations. Thus, Independent Umrah provides real added value to public service reform in the religious sector by making pilgrims active subjects, not simply recipients of services.⁵² Theoretically, this research contributes to the development of two major paradigms in contemporary policy implementation studies: Collaborative Governance 2.0 and Digital Era Governance. Empirical findings reinforce the assumption that successful policy implementation depends heavily on actors' ability to collaborate in uncertain situations. Collaboration between the government, travel agencies, and pilgrims demonstrates the co-creation process in creating new public value. Meanwhile, a digital governance approach has proven effective in streamlining services and expanding access through systematic data integration. This combination demonstrates that the success of public policy in the digital era is the result of a dynamic interaction between social preparedness and technological excellence.⁵³

⁵¹ Ratminto and Atik Septi Winarsih, *Manajemen Pelayanan Pengembangan Model Konseptual, Penerapan Citizen's Charter Dan Standar Pelayanan Minimal* (Pustaka Pelajar, 2020).

⁵² Hardiyansyah, *Kualitas Pelayanan Publik: Konsep, Dimensi, Indikator Dan Implementasinya* (Gava Media, 2021).

⁵³ Inu Kencana Syafiie, *Ilmu Administrasi Publik* (Pustaka Pelajar, 2022).

The policy implications of this research point to the need to strengthen the digital literacy of pilgrims, cross-sector integration between agencies, and periodic evaluation of the digital system. The government needs to expand the reach of digital training in areas with low literacy rates to ensure this policy is truly inclusive. Furthermore, strengthening collaboration between the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Ministry of Communication and Information, and the Civil Registration Agency (Dukcapil) is crucial to ensure the security of pilgrim data and the sustainability of the system. Abdul Rozaq from MHU Walisongo Tour even proposed that the bureau be given an official role in educating pilgrims to build productive partnerships, rather than competition. This suggestion demonstrates that policy sustainability depends heavily on the bureaucracy's ability to manage collaborative networks with non-governmental actors in a transparent and accountable manner.⁵⁴

As a critical reflection, the success of the Independent Umrah policy depends heavily on the balance between digital innovation and the community's social preparedness. A sophisticated system will be ineffective without user trust and competence in operating it. The government must ensure that digital transformation does not lead to exclusion for pilgrims with technological limitations. As a Ministry of Religious Affairs official stated, "the biggest challenge is not the system, but the readiness of the people." By understanding this aspect, the Independent Umrah policy can continue to be developed as a model of collaborative governance that is humanistic, inclusive, and adaptive in the era of digital transformation. Integration between the technological and social dimensions is key to ensuring this policy truly delivers sustainable public benefits.

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the Independent Umrah policy is a significant innovation in the reform of religious public services in Indonesia, oriented towards efficiency, transparency, and the independence of pilgrims. Based on the results of analysis and interviews with the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the MHU Walisongo Tour travel agency, and independent Umrah pilgrims, it was found that the implementation of this policy presents two interacting sides: the idealism of the policy that has been realized in the form of regulations and the SISKOPATUH digital system, and the reality of implementation that still faces challenges of digital literacy, resistance from travel agencies, and infrastructure disparities between regions. The government demonstrated adaptive steps through training, collaboration, and cross-agency data integration in an effort to balance the demands of digital transformation with the community's social preparedness.

Theoretically, this research strengthens the relevance of Collaborative Governance 2.0 and Digital Era Governance as analytical frameworks for policy implementation in the digital era.

⁵⁴ Muhadam Labolo, *Memahami Ilmu Pemerintahan: Suatu Kajian Teoretis* (Rajawali Pers, 2021).

Collaboration between the government, agencies, and pilgrims has proven to be a key factor in maintaining policy sustainability and building public trust. The success of Independent Umrah is determined not only by the quality of the technology, but also by the ability of all actors to adapt, share roles, and build a shared awareness of the importance of inclusive and accountable pilgrimage governance. Therefore, the sustainability of this policy requires a government commitment to strengthening digital literacy, expanding infrastructure access, and making digital transformation not merely an administrative innovation but a means of community spiritual empowerment.

Thank-you note

Author AM (Ahmad Mustofa) would like to thank the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, especially the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of Central Java Province, which has provided permission and information during the research process regarding the Independent Umrah policy. Thanks are also extended to the MHU Walisongo Tour Travel Bureau, which has been willing to be a field resource person, as well as to Mrs. Ade Eka Safitri as an Independent Umrah pilgrim who has participated in the interview and shared very valuable empirical experiences. As well as my beloved family, my parents Maesun who have always prayed for me so far, not forgetting also to my own siblings, thank you for motivating me in working on this final assignment, the author would like to express his appreciation to Walisongo State Islamic University Semarang, which has provided academic support and research facilities. This research was conducted independently without financial support from sponsoring institutions, but all data was obtained through a legitimate and ethical research process in accordance with scientific research guidelines.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ansell, Chris, and Jacob Torfing. "Institutional Resistance to Innovation in the Public Sector." *Public Management Review*, 2021.
- Clarke, Amanda. "Digital Government Units: What Are They, and Why Do They Matter?" *Public Management Review* 22, no. 3 (2020): 354–73.
- Dunleavy, Patrick, and Helen Margetts. "Data Science, Artificial Intelligence and the Future of Governance." *Policy and Politics* 49, no. 1 (2021): 3–21.
- Dwiyanto, Agus. *Mewujudkan Good Governance Melalui Pelayanan Publik*. Gadjah Mada University Press, 2021.
- Hardiyansyah. *Kualitas Pelayanan Publik: Konsep, Dimensi, Indikator Dan Implementasinya*. Gava Media, 2021.
- Hasibuan, Zainal A. "Transformasi Digital Di Indonesia: Tantangan Literasi Dan Kesiapan Infrastruktur." *Jurnal Sistem Informasi Dan Teknologi* 15, no. 3 (2021).

- Hidayat, R. "Implementasi Kebijakan Umrah Mandiri Dalam Perspektif Perlindungan Jamaah." *Jurnal Ilmu Kebijakan Publik Dan Sosial* 5, no. 2 (2023): 115–28.
- Indrajit, Richardus Eko. *E-Government: Strategi Pembangunan Dan Pengembangan Sistem Pelayanan Publik Berbasis Teknologi Digital*. Pre-Press, 2020.
- Jensen, Christian, and Staffan Johansson. "The Projectification of Public Administration." *International Journal of Public Administration* 41, no. 11 (2018): 845–55.
- Kurniawan, Teguh. "Collaborative Governance Dalam Pelayanan Publik Di Era Disrupsi." *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara* 18, no. 1 (2022).
- Kurniawan, Teguh. "Collaborative Governance Dalam Pelayanan Publik Di Era Disrupsi Digital." *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara* 18, no. 1 (2022).
- Kurniawan, Teguh. "Tantangan Birokrasi Digital Di Negara Berkembang: Perspektif Indonesia." *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara* 18, no. 2 (2022).
- Labolo, Muhadam. *Memahami Ilmu Pemerintahan: Suatu Kajian Teoretis*. Rajawali Pers, 2021.
- Matland, Richard E. "Synthesizing the Implementation Literature: The Ambiguity-Conflict Model of Policy Implementation." *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 5, no. 2 (1995): 145–74.
- Nasution, A. I. "Kesenjangan Digital Dan Tantangan Pelayanan Publik Di Indonesia." *Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Informatika* 14, no. 1 (2020).
- Nugroho, R. *Public Policy: Teori, Manajemen, Dinamika, Analisis, Konvergensi, Dan Kimia Kebijakan*. 2017.
- Pasolong, Harbani. *Teori Administrasi Publik*. Alfabeta, 2020.
- Prasojo, Eko. "Transformasi Digital Dan Reformasi Birokrasi Di Indonesia: Peluang Dan Tantangan." *Jurnal Studi Pemerintahan* 12, no. 2 (2021).
- Pülzl, Helga, and Oliver Treib. *Implementing Public Policy BT - Handbook of Public Policy Analysis*. Routledge, 2021.
- Ratminto, and Atik Septi Winarsih. *Manajemen Pelayanan Pengembangan Model Konseptual, Penerapan Citizen's Charter Dan Standar Pelayanan Minimal*. Pustaka Pelajar, 2020.
- RI, Kementerian Agama. *Petunjuk Teknis Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Umrah Mandiri*. Direktorat Bina Umrah dan Haji Khusus, 2022.
- RI, Kementerian Agama. "Wawancara Pegawai Kanwil Kemenag Jawa Tengah Terkait UU No. 14 Tahun 2025." Preprint, 2025.
- RI, Kementrian Agama. "Wawancara Mengenai Evaluasi Pasca-Musim Haji UU No. 14 Tahun 2025." Preprint, 2025.
- Rozaq, Abdul. "Hasil Wawancara Mendalam: Resistensi Dan Dampak Ekonomi Umrah Mandiri." Preprint, 2025.
- Rozaq, Abdul. "Wawancara: Analisis Dampak Restrukturisasi Operasional Biro Travel." Preprint, 2025.
- Rozaq, Abdul. "Wawancara: Keberatan Biro Travel Terhadap Perubahan Struktur Pelayanan Umrah." Preprint, 2025.
- Rozaq, Abdul. "Wawancara: Transformasi Peran Biro Travel Sebagai Mitra Strategis." Preprint, 2025.
- Safitri, Ade Eka. "Hasil Wawancara Mendalam: Motivasi Dan Pengalaman Umrah Mandiri." Preprint, 2025.

- Safitri, Ade Eka. "Wawancara: Keberhasilan Adaptasi Teknologi Bagi Jamaah Mandiri." Preprint, 2025.
- Safitri, Ade Eka. "Wawancara Mendalam: Pengalaman Dan Kemudahan Teknis Umrah Mandiri." Preprint, 2025.
- Safitri, Ade Eka. "Wawancara: Tantangan Literasi Digital Jamaah Umrah Mandiri." Preprint, 2025.
- Saniman. "Interoperabilitas Data Dalam Mewujudkan Sistem Pemerintahan Berbasis Elektronik (SPBE)." *Jurnal Teknologi Informasi Dan Komunikasi* 10, no. 2 (2021).
- Suaib, Eka S. "Dinamika Konflik Dan Kolaborasi Dalam Implementasi Kebijakan Publik." *Jurnal Administrasi Publik Indonesia* 10, no. 1 (2021).
- Subianto, Agus. *Kebijakan Publik: Tinjauan Perencanaan, Implementasi Dan Evaluasi*. Brilliant, 2020.
- Sugiyono. *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Alfabeta, 2016.
- Sugiyono. *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, R&D*. Alfabeta, 2019.
- Suryono, Agus. *Teori Dan Strategi Perubahan Sosial*. Bumi Aksara, 2020.
- Syafiie, Inu Kencana. *Ilmu Administrasi Publik*. Pustaka Pelajar, 2022.
- Thoha, Miftah. *Manajemen Kepegawaian Sipil Di Indonesia*. Kencana, 2020.
- Wahid, A. "Digitalisasi Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Umrah Di Indonesia: Peluang Dan Tantangan." *Jurnal Kajian Keagamaan Dan Sosial* 12, no. 1 (2023): 67–80.